

# **Can The Rebbe Be Moshiach?**

**Proofs from Gemara, Midrash,  
and Rambam that the  
Rebbe זצ"ל cannot  
be Moshiach**

by

Gil Student

Can the Rebbe be Moshiach?  
Student, Gil

© 2002 Gil Student  
All Rights Reserved  
Contact at: [author@moshiachtalk.com](mailto:author@moshiachtalk.com)

This book may not be reproduced, copied, and/or distributed  
without prior permission in writing from the author.

Portions of the book can be downloaded for free from  
<http://www.moshiachtalk.com>

## Can the Rebbe be Moshiach?

---

Preface	1
Introduction	3
Chapter 1: What is Moshiach?	9
Chapter 2: Who is the Rebbe?	20
Chapter 3: Is the Rebbe alive?	24
Chapter 4: Can a Dead Man be Moshiach?	46
Chapter 5: What Counter-proofs can be Brought?	67
Chapter 6: Is this Heresy?	92
Appendix A: Is Yaakov Avinu Alive?	101
Appendix B: Maharal on Moshiach's Name	115
Index	124

---

## **Preface:**

The light of the Torah is meant to dispel the darkness of ignorance. However, there are times when Torah is used to confuse rather than to enlighten. In these cases it is incumbent upon those who were blessed with knowledge to publicize the truth and dispel the darkness of falsehood.

Eight years ago, there was a history professor who was widely acclaimed as one of the leading Modern Orthodox figures of the time. There are very few talmidei chachamim who are academics and this particular rabbi was a tremendous baal midos (refined individual) as well. Not being in his circle, I had never met him. But I had heard of his sterling reputation and, after reading some of his works, concluded that his reputation of being a scholarly talmid chacham was well deserved. His essay on miracles and hashgacha pratit in the writings of Ramban (in Rabbi Moses Nahmanides: Explorations in His Religious and Literary Virtuosity, Isadore Twersky ed.) had a particularly strong effect on me because I had struggled for a long time with the

Ramban's apparently contradicting statements. This was a man of whom Modern Orthodoxy was proud. A respected scholar, an accomplished talmid chacham, and a humble, unassuming person. Then he spoke out against Lubavitch meshichism.

Those who are reading this and had never heard of Dr. David Berger before he spoke out on this subject are probably surprised about his reputation. There are certainly plenty who will deny that it ever existed. But we are not living in an Orwellian universe and no one can erase the memories of those of us who remember beyond eight years ago. The man who is now threatened, harassed, and publicly insulted by rabbis (!!!) was once widely considered to be a fine example of religious virtue in the Modern Orthodox world. Even those of us who were not part of that community respected him. But now he is persona non grata in many places throughout the world. His speeches elicit protest and he has personally been compared in writing to pigs and donkeys.

It is for this reason that I would like to remind the public that the Torah prohibits personal attacks. When someone wishes to criticize the content of this book, this author's personal piety or knowledge are not the issue. Whatever shortcomings I have, and I have many, they are irrelevant to the points raised in this work.

Before we begin I would like to express my deepest thanks to those who have contributed to and reviewed this book. Their efforts greatly enhanced this work.